

Report of the Policy, Performance and Change Manager, Office of the Chief Executive

## **York After Five**

### **Summary**

1. This report provides additional evidence to assist with the work on the ongoing corporate scrutiny review of York's evening economy. Members are asked to note the contents.

### **Background**

2. The development of policy is currently under the spotlight, and the council's policy processes are being reviewed in order to ensure that:
  - Key questions affecting the city are addressed.
  - The council opens up the policy process at all stages to residents/partners and others.
  - There is a constant focus on outcomes.

### **Defining the Problem**

3. The evening economy is one of the most important elements of York's local economy. Bars, restaurants and clubs together provide 6.9% of city-centre employment, and contribute almost a quarter of a billion pounds to the city's economy - £220 million in direct spend, which with the multiplier effect amounts to £300 million per annum (the multiplier effect being the additional increase in spending indirectly associated with an initial spend, for example the amount spent on wages for staff leads to those staff spending wages in the city's economy).
4. The below table shows the importance of York's late night economy compared with other places. York has the second-highest reliance on the evening economy for employment in the UK, second only to

Bournemouth, and well ahead of cities such as Edinburgh, Sheffield and Manchester.

Area	Total in Employment in "Evening Economy" sectors (2012)	Proportion of total in Employment in "Evening Economy" sectors (2012)	Percentage point change since 2009
Bournemouth	6900	8.9%	-0.3%
York	6700	6.5%	0.6%
Brighton and Hove	8000	6.3%	0.9%
Bath and North East Somerset	5000	5.8%	0.4%
Edinburgh, City of	18100	5.6%	0.1%
Cheshire West and Chester	8300	5.5%	0.8%
Liverpool	10600	4.6%	0.3%
Norwich	3900	4.5%	0.3%
Plymouth	4800	4.4%	0.0%
Glasgow City	16600	4.3%	0.2%
Oxford	4500	4.3%	1.0%
Cambridge	3700	4.1%	0.6%
Aberdeen City	7200	4.0%	0.4%
Bristol, City of	9200	3.9%	0.4%
Birmingham	15300	3.2%	0.2%
Leeds	12700	3.1%	-0.1%
Nottingham	6000	3.0%	-0.2%
Sheffield	7300	3.0%	-0.1%

Source: Business Register and Employment Survey 2012

- The percentage of employment in the evening sector is increasing, whereas in some other cities (e.g. Leeds) the level is decreasing. York has long been a popular destination for day-time visitors, but there is an increasing focus on converting day visitors into overnight stays, given the difference in comparative spend.
- According to recent statistics from Visit York, annual visitor spending is up by £163 million from £443 million to £606 million. Visitor numbers have remained constant at 7 million – an estimated 6 million leisure visits and 1 million business visits. Overnight visitors account for the lion's share of the value of tourism, contributing £399m compared to £207m from day visitors (66% v 34%).
- The previous strategy for the Night Time Economy was written in 2007, with a particular focus on tourism. This strategy is now due for revision,

and in light of Visit York's work on increasing the visitor economy, the emphasis of this revision has been on capturing the views of residents.

8. At the same time, we have examined factors that might work to prevent evening economic activity, in particular the role of anti-social behaviour. CYC is a member of a working group known as AVANTE (Alcohol, Violence and the Night-Time Economy) which operates in conjunction with the police to develop policies to mitigate the effects of alcohol-related anti-social behaviour in York. An update on the work of AVANTE was provided for this Committee's consideration at its meeting in March 2014, in support of the ongoing corporate scrutiny review.
9. York has a dense concentration of licensed establishments within the city walls, and while this has attracted people to the town centre, the proposals are now to create a Cumulative Impact Zone (COZ) to maintain a balance in the city centre.
10. York's community safety statistics are better than many of its comparator group (note that violent crime is used as a proxy indicator for alcohol-related disorder; lower number of crimes is better):

CSP	Violent Crime 2012-13	Population	Per 1000	Rank
Norwich	3156	134264	23.5	26
Hull	5678	257204	22.1	35
Cardiff	6166	348493	17.7	62
Oxford	2546	152527	16.7	73
Leeds	10819	757655	14.3	121
Cambridge	1722	125155	13.8	130
Newcastle	3855	282442	13.6	133
Bath	2402	177643	13.5	137
York	2485	200018	12.4	159
Canterbury	1763	153399	11.5	185
Sheffield	5646	557382	10.1	218
Winchester	1182	117702	10.0	223
Durham	4611	514348	9.0	249
City of London	778	7604	102.3	1
City of Westminster	9989	223858	44.6	2
Blackpool	4710	141976	33.2	3
Tewkesbury	432	82984	5.2	324
South Cambridgeshire	775	151068	5.1	325
North Kesteven	445	109263	4.1	326

11. The highest scoring (worst for crime) areas (i.e. City of London = 1) as well as the lowest scoring areas (North Kesteven = 326) are included for comparison.

### **Setting the Agenda**

12. Any strategy on the late night economy should aim to:
- (a) Grow the value of the night time economy in York; and
  - (b) Address the impact of the late night economy (including antisocial behaviour, perceptions of antisocial behaviour and public health).
13. In July 2013 Corporate Scrutiny Management Committee agreed to undertake a cross-cutting corporate review of the evening economy, with each individual scrutiny committee selecting their own topic based on their individual terms of reference.
14. Initial findings brought the understanding that the evening economy consisted of three distinct time zones: 5-7pm, 7-11pm, and 11pm – 6am (or early, mid- and late evening). Key to capturing the day visitor and keeping working residents within the city centre is the early evening time zone - a lack of reasons to be in the city centre in the early evening leads directly to lack of footfall.

### **Consultations**

15. A series of consultations was held between November 2013 and February 2014, and these have been summarised in the table below.

<b>Survey</b>	<b>Type</b>	<b>Date of survey</b>	<b>Topics covered</b>	<b>Number of responses</b>
Residents – open to all	Online questionnaire	Nov 2013	Wide range of questions on evening economy, including open questions on improvements	469
Residents' Talkabout Panel - Focus Groups	Discussion	13 & 25 Nov 2013	Motivating and deterring factors for visiting the city, improvements	13

Staff Drop-in sessions	Discussion	13 Jan 2014	Motivating and deterring factors, improvements	83
Pub Watch members	Discussion & subsequent interviews	28 Jan 2014	Motivating and deterring factors, improvements	12
Cumulative Impact Zone extension	Online	Jan/Feb 2014	Proposal to extend CIZ to include Swinegate/Fossgate	1

16. The first was held at the request of Scrutiny, to inform their reviews, and subsequent consultations have been held to investigate individual aspects of the evening economy. The questions in the residents on-line survey were designed to support the work on the individual scrutiny reviews (except Health) focussing on four main areas of review: cultural opportunities in the early evening, retail opening hours & transport, anti-social behaviour and street cleaning.
17. In addition two focus groups with residents were undertaken using our Talkabout panel. Invites were sent to 250 members of the panel with 22 agreeing to take part in focus group sessions. These ran in the early evening in November 2013, although numbers attending were lower than expected. Those who could not attend were encouraged to complete the online survey. Lack of numbers and timescales meant only two focus group sessions were undertaken.
18. As a large proportion of staff are also York residents or could be interested in the issue, a staff drop in session was run in January 2014. This was advertised in buzz, the staff newsletter, via the intranet and with flyers distributed through West Offices.
19. Comments made by staff as part of the staff drop-in sessions are attached as Annex A. Staff had similar concerns to those expressed by residents, with the addition of concerns over late night working.
20. Discussions were held with members of the licensed retail trade, via Pubwatch, the local trade body, and via individual interviews. The issues of transport and parking were frequently mentioned, since pub and restaurant staff also depend on these, and a need for better advertising of late night parking (and the costs) was identified. Other comments included the significant damage that the recession has done to the 5-8 trade.

21. The Cumulative Impact Zone proposes to extend the area in which further licensed premises may be limited, to cover the Stonegate/ Swinegate/Fossgate areas. There was little response from the public on this issue.
22. There is already some work ongoing in York to address the main areas of concern identified by the consultation responses (as listed above in paragraph 18):
23. Cultural opportunities  
The issue - A large number of those surveyed regretted the lack of early evening cultural events and late opening of museums and visitor attractions. This has led to day visitors leaving the city between five and six, rather than staying on, and then subsequently going to the theatre, out for meal or similar. However, 72% of survey respondents said their visit to city in the evening included cultural reasons.
24. Existing work in this area includes the following:
  - Visit York has adopted a new visitor strategy, which includes the promotion of York as a year-round city, using the many festivals in the city as part of the strategy.
  - This year in particular there is a programme of events leading up to the Tour de France. The Guildhall is being developed as centre for digital arts, and could form suitable venue for early evening digital arts events.
  - The WoW partnership is looking to embed cultural strategy within economic plans.
  - Reinvigorate York is improving outdoor spaces currently used as open-air performance spaces, such as King's Square.
  - One of the projects included in the Reinvigorate York programme is the proposed pedestrianisation of Fossgate, bringing new areas into footstreets zones.
  - A review of markets, and the potential for evening use of the Newgate Market space.
  - The development of the Guildhall as a centre for digital arts could include space for evening cultural events.
25. Retail  
Define the problem: The majority of city centre retailers close between 5pm and 6pm in the evening. For those who work in the city, and leave their offices at 5pm or later, this means there is no opportunity for evening shopping. For those visiting the city, 5pm is too early to go for a meal, and therefore many visitors leave the city at the time when retailers

(and visitor attractions) close. In order to retain visitors, a closer alignment of retail hours with the evening economy would assist. The lack of options that did not involve alcohol was identified, in particular the lack of an early evening coffee culture.

26. In addition, respondents reported that there is little consistency between opening hours in an area of the city, with adjacent shops having different closing times. Previous late-evening closing hours have had mixed success, with issues such as lack of publicity, and poor alignment with public transport, being cited as factors.
27. Setting the agenda: 89% of survey respondents said they would stay in the city if shops were open later. This question was explored further in focus groups, and it became evident that there was a lack of knowledge about opening times, as well as a lack of consistency between retailers in a given area (in comparison to out-of-town centres, where it is common for retailers to stay open later).
28. Existing work in this area includes the following:
  - Development work in the Micklegate Quarter, including a memberships scheme, retailer discount, work on attracting new businesses, including new cafe;
  - The Markets strategy is under review to increase offer/ positioning/ footfall, aligned with investment through Invigorate York
  - A commercial study has been commissioned to look at overnight accommodation needs for the visitor economy;
  - TSB award application for digital innovation in the high street
  - Fashion City York – events scheduled for May.
29. Transport  
Define the problem: The survey identified two major areas of transport concern. One was the availability and cost of parking, and the other related to the availability and cost of buses. For many York residents these are the key means of access to the city centre.
30. There are inconsistencies in opening times for council-owned car parks, with some city centre car parks closing early: for example, Piccadilly closes at 18.30, Castle Mills at 20.30. For those using the Park and Ride sites, the last bus back is at 20.05, and therefore this discourages workers in the city from staying late, as they will need to leave to retrieve their vehicles.
31. Car parking fees are currently under review, as is the issue of pay-on-exit barriers. A trial pay-on-exit barrier is expected to be installed at a

pilot site, but the cost of doing so means that the effectiveness will need to be tested before further roll-out.

32. Existing work in this area includes the following:
  - work with the Quality Bus Partnership, including activity to make bus fares more affordable via through-ticketing and weekly tickets
  - investigating the use of different media for ticketing such as smart phones or smart cards
  - bus interchange works
  - bus network review
  - itravel – increasing awareness of different modes of transport and their availability
  - footstreet hours being extended, with the area extended to Fossgate as part of the Reinvigorate York proposals, to make walking an attractive option.
  
33. Anti-Social Behaviour  
Defining the problem: A high percentage of people had experienced anti-social behaviour, and overall 25 per cent said that this would affect their decision to visit the city centre in future. This rose to 34% among the 36-45 age group, which is a key age group for families.
  
34. An area of particular concern from a health point of view was the number of people attending the Emergency Department at York Hospital in a state of intoxication, increasing waiting times and limiting availability of medical resources.
  
35. Setting the agenda: Survey comments included perception that most antisocial behaviour comes from on stag and hen evenings and events at the race course, and inadequate monitoring of licensing laws, while there was a desire to see a visible police presence and for trains to and from the city to be monitored. However postcode data collected from the hospital showed the majority of those attending had YO postcodes.
  
36. At present an extensive programme of work is under way via the AVANTE partnership, with key deliverables including the reduction of violent crime and criminal damage in the Cumulative Impact Area, the introduction of the NightSafe radio system between night time services, and examining the case for the banning of sales of super-strength alcoholic drinks.
  
37. The crime statistics show that the student nights out on Wednesdays have little impact - the majority of reported incidents of the type used to record anti-social behaviour occur on Fridays and Saturdays.



38. Street cleaning was also an area of concern, and further work is required to better understand the constraints around collection of waste from city centre businesses as highlighted by the Community Safety Scrutiny Review.

### **Lessons learned from elsewhere**

39. The policy team has reviewed work on the evening and night-time economy at other local authorities, paying particular attention to those with similarities to York such as being a centre for tourism, having a strong university presence or being a Yorkshire & Humber sub-regional centre.
40. In particular, we found that Edinburgh had carried out an in-depth review of its evening economy in 2010, which led to an increased emphasis on working in conjunction with tourism-related businesses to cross-promote evening entertainment. The Edinburgh Tourism Action Group (ETAG) brochure from 2011 is attached as Annex A.
41. Some local authorities have applied for “Purple Flag” status, which is a quality kitemark for evening safety, and also assesses a range of criteria including appeal, attractiveness, cleanliness, and culture. In the course of accreditation, cities need both private and public sectors to work together to promote a safe environment.
42. The cities that successfully achieved Purple Flag status said they had found it achievable largely because they had already worked together in setting up a Business Improvement District (BID). Therefore it would be worth investigating the feasibility of establishing a BID for at least the area covering the town centre prior to considering an application for Purple Flag status.
43. Examples of good practice that have had a positive effect and may be transferable relating to the evening economy (some of which have been funded by BIDs) include:
- Norwich’s “Head Out Not Home” campaign, aimed at workers in the city
  - Norwich has set up a “Norwich Evenings” Facebook page as the official source of information for evening entertainment, where other Facebook users can post details of their events
  - Oxford’s “Alive After Five” campaign included work with retailers to extend opening hours in the city centre, and an increase in evening

bus services (including the Park and Ride to 11.30 pm on Fridays and Saturdays)

- Hull undertook a review of city centre street lighting, increasing lighting in certain areas to improve perceptions of safety
- Colchester has a non-profit volunteer initiative called “Slackspace” that uses empty premises as community art spaces, some of which are open in the early evening to capture the post-work visitor.

44. A full list of Purple Flag cities is attached as Annex B, together with a table summarising the main issues from comparator cities.

### **Equalities**

45. Both CYC research and experiences from elsewhere show that in addition to individual initiatives, there is a further issue to consider, that of equalities and in particular disabled access to city centre premises in the evening.

46. CYC currently works together with the website DisabledGo (<http://www.disabledgo.com/>) to help ensure that city centre premises are assessed for accessibility. By accessing the website, it is possible to check for a variety of accessibility levels.

47. So for example, should potential proposals to extend certain car park opening hours be adopted, this would have the effect of increasing accessibility to the areas of the city served by these car parks.

### **Options**

48. Not applicable.

### **Analysis**

49. The analysis is contained in the content of the report above.

### **Council Plan**

50. The evening and night time economy is of importance to the Council Plan priority “Grow the economy”.

### **Implications**

51. There are no known implications associated with the recommendation in this report. Any implications associated with the recommendations

arising from the corporate scrutiny review will be identified and addressed in the review final report when presented to Cabinet.

### **Risk Management**

52. Not applicable.

### **Recommendations**

53. Members are asked to note the contents of the report as part of their consideration of the evidence supporting the Night Time Economy Corporate Scrutiny Review.

### **Contact Details**

**Author:**

Helena Nowell  
Policy and Performance Officer  
Office of the Chief Executive  
01904 551746

**Senior Officer Responsible:**

Phil Witcherley  
Policy, Performance & Change Manager  
Office of the Chief Executive

**Approved**



**Date**

28 March 2014

**Wards Affected:**

**All**



**For further information please contact the author of the report**

**Background Papers:** None

**Annexes:**

Annex A – Edinburgh Tourism Action Group (ETAG) Report

Annex B – Purple Flag Map & Table of Issues from Comparator Cities

**Report Abbreviations:**

AVANTE	Alcohol, Violence and the Night Time Economy
BID	Business Improvement District
CIZ	Cumulative Impact Zone
CSP	Community Safety Partnership
CYC	City of York Council
ETAG	Edinburgh Tourism Action Group
WoW	Without Wall Partnership